

Design Review Board

Minutes

Tuesday, June 9, 2020
Council Chambers – Lower Level
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM

Board Members Present via virtual connection:

Chair Randy Carter

Vice Chair Scott Thomas

Boardmember Sean Banda

Boardmember Nicole Posten-Thompson

Boardmember J. Seth Placko

Boardmember Jeanette Knudsen

Boardmember Tanner Green

Board Members Absent:

None

Staff Present via virtual connection:

Tom Ellsworth, Principal Planner

Lesley Davis, Senior Planner

Wahid Alam, AICP, Planner II

Kellie Rorex, Planner I

Chair Randy Carter welcomed everyone to the Design Review Board Work Session at 4:30 p.m.

A. Call to Order

B. Consider the Minutes from the 6/9/2020 meeting

Vice Chair Thomas motions to approve the minutes, Boardmember Posten-Thompson seconds.

C. Discuss and Provide Direction Regarding Design Review cases:

This is a preliminary review of Design Review Board cases. The applicant and public may speak about the case, and the Board may provide comments and suggestions to assist the Applicant with the proposal, but the Board will not approve or deny a case under Preliminary Review.

Item C.1. DRB20-00244 Within the 9200 block of East Cadence Parkway (south side).

Council District 6. Located east of Ellsworth Road and south of Ray Road. (3.7± acres). Requesting the review of a new fitness center within the Cadence at Gateway development. Vince Di Bella, Adaptive Architects, Inc., Applicant; PPGN-ELLSWORTH LLLP, Owner.

Staff Planner, Wahid Alam, presented the proposed new fitness center.

Applicant, Vince Di Bella with Adaptive Architects Inc. was available for Board questions.

Boardmember Knudsen

- Check the grey paint colors to ensure they harmonize well.
- Ensure the grays are not on the cool side because earth tones are required for the color palette.

Boardmember Green

- Confirmed the use of the adjacent property to the southeast.
 - Mr. Di Bella responds: Residential.
- Asked will there be a wall or separation between commercial and residential?
 - Mr. Di Bella responds: Yes, the developer will add the wall and landscape on the adjacent property.

Boardmember Banda

- Appreciates the front façade and canopies.
- Likes the use of angles.
- Appreciates the design and architectural elements incorporated into this building.
- Confirmed the lighting on the front façade and noted that he appreciated the “at night” rendering.

Boardmember Thompson

- Agreed with Boardmember Knudsen that they need to be careful with the choice of grey paint.

Vice Chair Thomas

- No additional comments

Boardmember Placko

- No additional comments

Chair Carter thanked Mr. DiBella for his project and noted that no changes were requested by the board except to make sure that the grey paint choice harmonizes with the rest of the development.

Item C.2. DRB20-00245 Within the 5500 block of E Baseline Road (north side).

Council District 2. Located East of Higley Road on the North side of Baseline Road. (2.3± acres). Requesting the review of new medical office buildings. Vince Di Bella, Adaptive Architects, Inc., Applicant; Kelly/Kevin V/Kemp R./Judith Ann Morris, Owner.

Staff Planner, Kellie Rorex presented the new proposed medical building.

Applicant, Vince Di Bella with Adaptive Architects Inc. explained the site layout and described some of the design features and landscape elements they are using that are somewhat unusual. He stated that the property owner is a landscape contractor and they they have some cast iron pieces would like to incorporate into the design. He noted that he was available for Board questions.

Boardmember Banda

- Noted the unique building and was curious about the inspiration of the design.
- Lighting plan does not reflect building lighting, just parking lot lighting.
- Confirmed with the applicant that the overhang projection for the eaves is 18-inches and suggested increasing that depth, if possible.
- Confirmed that the brick on the header projects out.
- Emphasize the use of the churned masonry over header.
- Appreciates the courtyard and the placement of building closer to the street.
- Likes the sign type integrated with the building architecture.
- Keep kelvin below 3500 to keep the warm look.
- Remove gables, exaggerate the overhang and corbels.

Boardmember Green

- Thinks the architecture is unique.
- Color palette has a lot going on, not crazy about the contrasting colors on the tower.
- Struggling with a painted roof and would prefer a natural patina.
- Noted that there is a lot of colors with the plant choices in the landscape plan.
- Appreciates the grass between the parking on the north side.
- Confirmed the material in the landscaping is decomposed granite.

Boardmember Placko

- Landscape planting plan is interesting, unique, and retro.
- Do plants have to be low water use?
 - Staff confirmed that per the Arizona Department of Water Resources (ADWR), the landscaping in the right-of-way must be low water use.
- The Mexican Honeysuckle along the frontage will not likely survive.
- The Compact Pittosporum lining the parking will not likely survive after a couple of summers.
- Concerned that the Ruellia Penninsularis will block the view coming out of the parking stalls and would suggest something lower.
- Indian Hawthorne may not survive the heat.
- Suggested that Wild Petunia is on the palette and could be used to replace the Indian Hawthorne and Pittosporum.
- Confirmed that the area along Baseline Road includes a berm.
- Sago palms need some shade.
- Watch for thorny plant material in pedestrian areas.
- Any of the trees in the Palo Verde family would best pick up the roof color.
- Wild petunia could also compliment the roof color.

Boardmember Knudsen

- Bring in a yellow-flowering plant that will accent the roof.
- Noted the roof color needs to be repeated somewhere in the design.
Mr. DiBella responds: He would add the green to the carport and the gates throughout the project.
- Consider adding large planting pots to repeat the roof color.
Mr. DiBella responds: The cast iron pots the owner wants to use at the entry courtyard will be sandblasted and either painted or left in their natural state.
- Agrees that Palo Verde trees would accent the roof color well.
- Feels the Quoining on the building distracts from the tower look; suggests removing the quoining.
- Suggested paint in the arches.

Boardmember Posten-Thompson

- Likes the color palette and patina look to the roof.
- Noted there were no doors into the courtyard.
Mr. DiBella responds: He explained that doors may end up entering the courtyard. It is a multi-tenant building and they just don't know the tenants wishes yet.
- East elevation seems ignored, does not display detailing that the west elevation does.
- If the window tint is blue or green, it will clash with the roof. Use a bronze or other complimentary tint on the glass.
- Add a thickened edge on the carports, match the building and canopy roofs.
- Paint steel on the carports to match one of the building colors.
- Gates for trash, match the building or roof color.
- Monument sign looks nice.
- Consider a shading element to the courtyard to increase pedestrian use, maybe in an accent roof color.

Vice Chair Thomas

- Likes the building.
- Likes the three different styles of masonry.
- Agrees with Boardmember Knudsen, the Quoining is distracting to the eye.
- If end gables are staying, how is it closed up?
 - Mr. Di Bella replied: same material as standing seam.
 - Mr. Thomas cautions to make sure it has a watertight seal.
 - Noted he does not care for the gables.
- Suggests using a prefabricated, patina dome.

Chair Carter

- Noted it is an interesting style and for a neo-classical style building, gables are out of place.
- Gables do not fit with architecture and seem to only be satisfying the new design guidelines, not the style of the building.
- Light fixtures seem incorrect with the architecture.
- Agrees the Quoins on the feel off but could be the same color and pulled out for shadow lines.
- East side very modular looking.
- Pull detailing from other elevations to the east side of the building.
- Suggested the use pilasters on the east elevation to emphasize the classic look and dress up the architecture.

Tom Ellsworth, Principal Planner, confirmed that the Design Review Board recommends that the applicant seek alternative compliance to the roof articulation requirements outlined in Section 11-6-3(B)(2)(b) of the MZO in order to remove gables shown on the proposed elevations. Chair Carter confirmed that is correct.

Summary:

1. Enhance the courtyard: consider adding shade feature, and doors that open to the courtyard.
2. East elevation: add pilasters or similar design element to make the design more harmonious with west elevation.
3. Add a thickened edge to parking canopies.
4. Use 3000-3500 Kelvin for lighting on the building.
5. Remove the contrasting colored Quoining.
6. Plants: review the landscape plan for plants that are more water sensitive and consider survivability of the plants based on location.
7. Change decomposed granite (DC) to a larger aggregate. Suggest using screened ½" material in a warmer tone that is not gold.
8. Remove Sago Palms on the west of the building.
9. Repeat the color of the roof into the design for the rest of the site in locations such as planters, , shade sales, and/or parking canopies.
10. Remove the gables from the building design and seek alternative compliance for roof articulation in accordance with Section 11-6-3(B)(2)(b) of the MZO.
11. Glass color is to be a complimentary neutral color other than blue or green.

Item C.3. DRB20-00286 Within the 10000 block of E Southern Avenue (north side).

Council District 6. Located east Crismon Road on the north side of Southern Avenue. (1.57± acres). Requesting the review of a new medical office building. Carrie Fennelly, Cawley Architects, Applicant; Pros Investments LLC, Owner.

Staff Planner: Kellie Rorex

Continue to July 14, 2020 Work Session

D. Discuss and take action on the following Design Review case: None

E. Adjournment

Adjourns without objection at 5:47 p.m.

Boardmember Posten-Thompson motions to adjourn, Boardmember Knudsen seconds.

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the City Manager's Office at (480) 644- 3333 or AzRelay 7-1-1 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. **Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar al menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 480-644- 2767.**